

**JIM. GIBBONS**  
Governor



STATE OF NEVADA  
**STATE ENVIRONMENTAL COMMISSION**

901 South Stewart Street, Suite 4001  
Carson City, Nevada 89701-5249  
Telephone (775) 687-9308  
Fax (775) 687-5856  
[www.sec.nv.gov](http://www.sec.nv.gov)

**ALLEN BIAGGI**  
Director



CHAIRMAN:  
Lew Dodgion  
Carson City, NV

November 08, 2007

VICE CHAIRMAN:  
Alan Coyner  
Administrator  
Division of Minerals  
Commission on Mineral  
Resources

Mr. Mike Kwiatkowski  
General Manager - Ponderosa Dairy  
900 Mecca Road  
Amargosa Valley NV, 89020

MEMBERS

Pete Anderson  
State Forester  
Division of Forestry

Donna Rise, Director  
Department of  
Agriculture

Eugene Gans  
Las Vegas, NV

Kenneth Mayer - Director  
Department of Wildlife

Ira Rackley  
Las Vegas, NV

Tracy Taylor  
State Engineer  
Division of Water Resources

Harry Shull  
Las Vegas, NV

Frances Barron  
State Board of Health  
Las Vegas, NV

Stephanne Zimmerman  
Las Vegas, NV

COUNSEL  
Rose Marie Reynolds

STAFF  
[John B. Walker](#)  
Executive Secretary

[Robert Pearson](#)  
Recording Secretary

**RE: Opportunity to Intervene: SEC Appeal for Permit NV0023027**

Dear Mr. Kwiatkowski:

On October 25, 2007 the Nevada Division of Environmental Protection issued a notice of decision for permit number NV0023027. The decision, by NDEP's Bureau of Water Pollution Control (Bureau), made final a re-issuance of a National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) Permit [NV0023027] for a concentrated animal feeding operation at Ponderosa Dairy.

The permit authorizes the increased discharge of manure and process waste water to groundwater and surface water via land application, irrigation, and stormwater runoff in accordance with a Bureau-approved Nutrient Management Plan (NMP).

On November 03, 2007 the permit was appealed to the State Environmental Commission by the following individuals:

John Bosta  
P.O. Box 42  
Amargosa Valley, NV 89020

Antonio Guerra Martinez  
HCR 70 Box 570  
Amargosa Valley, NV 89020

With this letter I am advising that you may seek to intervene in the appeal process concerning the above referenced permit. For your information please find attached the SEC's Rules of Practice; these rules govern disposition of contested cases including requirement for interveners.

Also attached are copies of the appeals filed by the above referenced parties. If you have any questions about this letter please contact me.

Sincerely,

John B. Walker  
Executive Secretary

JBW/jbw  
ecc: John Bosta, Appellant  
Antonio Guerra Martinez, Appellant  
Alan Coyner, SEC Panel Chair  
Tom Porta, Deputy. Admin/NDEP  
John Palm, NDEP/BWPC  
Al Tinney, NDEP/BWPC  
Bruce Holmgren, NDEP/BWPC  
William Frey, NDEP/SDAG  
Rose Marie Reynolds, SEC/DAG

FORM FOR REQUESTING AN APPEAL HEARING  
BEFORE THE NEVADA STATE ENVIRONMENTAL COMMISSION

RECEIVED

NOV - 2 2007

~~ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION~~

1. Name, address, telephone number, and signature of applicant:  
 Name: John Bosta  
 Address: P.O. Box 42 Amargosa Valley, NV 89020  
 Telephone: (775) 372-9039  
 Signature: *John F. Bosta*  
 Representative Capacity (if applicable): \_\_\_\_\_
2. Specify type of applicant: Individual, Partnership, Corporation, or Other: Individual
3. Other person or persons authorized to receive service of notice: \_\_\_\_\_
4. Complete description of the business or activity and the location of the activity involved in the request: Permit Number NV0023027, Rockview Farms, Inc., Ponderosa Dairy fact sheet of NDEP and Bureau approved Nutrient Management Plan gives a description of the business and activities the Ponderosa Dairy operation in Amargosa Valley.
5. Nature of the appeal and grounds thereof: The Nevada Division of Environmental Protection (NDEP), Bureau of Water Pollutant Control (Bureau) decision, October 25, 2007, to issue National Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) Permit NV0023027 authorizing the increased discharge of manure and process wastewater to groundwater and surface water via land application, irrigation, and stormwater runoff in accordance with a Bureau approved Nutrient Management Plan (NMP) at Ponderosa Dairy in Amargosa Valley is Colorable. The information that has been provided is insufficient because facts has been withheld or denied. The assurance of the Bureau that the waters of the State will not be degraded from this operation and that public safety and health will be protected is Colorable. The June 12, 2007 Public Hearing in Amargosa Valley violated the Open Meeting Law. Decisions and responses of NDEP and Bureau are actions taken under "color of state and federal law."
6. Section or sections of the State Air Quality Regulations, Water Pollution Control Regulations, Hazardous Waste Regulations, Solid Waste Management Regulations, or NRS section involved in the appeal: Nevada Administrative Code (NAC) 445.228 through NAC 445.263, 40 CFR Parts 9,122, 123, and 412 National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permit Regulation and Effluent Limitation Guidelines and Standards for Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations (CAFOs), Open Meeting Law NRS 228.150, and Nevada Water Pollutant Control Law NRS 445A.300 through 445A.730.
7. Approximate time in hours and minutes necessary for delivery of oral testimony and reading of prepared statements as admissible evidence to be entered in the record: 1 hour

Date of Request 10/31/07

FORM FOR REQUESTING AN APPEAL HEARING  
BEFORE THE NEVADA STATE ENVIRONMENTAL COMMISSION

RECEIVED

NOV - 2 2007

~~ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION~~

1. Name, address, telephone number, and signature of applicant:  
 Name: John Bosta  
 Address: P.O. Box 42 Amargosa Valley, NV 89020  
 Telephone: (775) 372-9039  
 Signature: *John F. Bosta*  
 Representative Capacity (if applicable): \_\_\_\_\_
2. Specify type of applicant: Individual, Partnership, Corporation, or Other: Individual
3. Other person or persons authorized to receive service of notice: \_\_\_\_\_
4. Complete description of the business or activity and the location of the activity involved in the request: Permit Number NV0023027, Rockview Farms, Inc., Ponderosa Dairy fact sheet of NDEP and Bureau approved Nutrient Management Plan gives a description of the business and activities the Ponderosa Dairy operation in Amargosa Valley.
5. Nature of the appeal and grounds thereof: The Nevada Division of Environmental Protection (NDEP), Bureau of Water Pollutant Control (Bureau) decision, October 25, 2007, to issue National Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) Permit NV0023027 authorizing the increased discharge of manure and process wastewater to groundwater and surface water via land application, irrigation, and stormwater runoff in accordance with a Bureau approved Nutrient Management Plan (NMP) at Ponderosa Dairy in Amargosa Valley is Colorable. The information that has been provided is insufficient because facts has been withheld or denied. The assurance of the Bureau that the waters of the State will not be degraded from this operation and that public safety and health will be protected is Colorable. The June 12, 2007 Public Hearing in Amargosa Valley violated the Open Meeting Law. Decisions and responses of NDEP and Bureau are actions taken under "color of state and federal law."
6. Section or sections of the State Air Quality Regulations, Water Pollution Control Regulations, Hazardous Waste Regulations, Solid Waste Management Regulations, or NRS section involved in the appeal: Nevada Administrative Code (NAC) 445.228 through NAC 445.263, 40 CFR Parts 9,122, 123, and 412 National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permit Regulation and Effluent Limitation Guidelines and Standards for Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations (CAFOs), Open Meeting Law NRS 228.150, and Nevada Water Pollutant Control Law NRS 445A.300 through 445A.730.
7. Approximate time in hours and minutes necessary for delivery of oral testimony and reading of prepared statements as admissible evidence to be entered in the record: 1 hour

Date of Request 10/31/07

**FORM # 3**  
**FORM FOR REQUESTING AN APPEAL HEARING**  
**BEFORE THE NEVADA STATE ENVIRONMENTAL COMMISSION**

1. Name, address, telephone number, and signature of applicant:

Name: Antonio Guerra Martinez

Address: HCR 70 Box 570 Amargosa Valley, NV 89020

Telephone: (775) 372-1240

Signature: AS

Representative Capacity (if applicable): \_\_\_\_\_

2. Specify type of applicant: Individual, Partnership, Corporation, or Other: Individual
3. Other person or persons authorized to receive service of notice: \_\_\_\_\_
4. Complete description of the business or activity and the location of the activity involved in the request: Permit Number NV0023027 Rockview Farms Inc. Ponderosa Dairy fact sheet of NEPD and Bureau approved Nutrient Management Plan gives a description of the business and activities of the Ponderosa Dairy operation in Amargosa Valley.
5. Nature of the appeal and grounds thereof: The Nevada Division of Environmental Protection (NDEP), Bureau of Water Pollutant Control (Bureau) decision, October 25, 2007, to issue National Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) Permit NV0023027 authorizing the increased discharge of manure and process wastewater to ground water and surface water via land application, irrigation, and stormwater runoff in accordance with a Bureau approved Nutrient Management Plan (NMP) at Ponderosa Dairy in Amargosa Valley is a bias decision. The information used to make the decision is insufficient because facts has been withheld or denied. The assurance of the Bureau that the waters of the State will not be degraded from this operation and the public safety and health will be protected can not be documented because no monitoring wells are required on the 8 lagoons, 10 ponds, 12 fields and the three containment yards. The June 12, 2007 Public Hearing in Amargosa Valley violated the Open Meeting Law.
6. Section or sections of the State Air Quality Regulations, Water Pollution Control Regulations, Hazardous Waste Regulations, Solid Waste Management Regulations, or NRS section involved in the appeal: Nevada Administrative Code (NAC) 445.228 through NAC 445.263, 40 CFR Parts 9, 122, 123, and 412, National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permit Regulation and Effluent Limitation Guidelines and Standards for Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations (CAFOs), Open Meeting Law NRS 228.150, and Nevada Water Pollutant Control Law NRS 445A.300 through 445A.730.
7. Approximate time in hours and minutes necessary for delivery of oral testimony and reading of prepared statements as admissible evidence to be entered in the record: 30 minutes

Date of Request 11/3/2007

**PRACTICE BEFORE THE STATE ENVIRONMENTAL  
COMMISSION**  
2006 Codified Version

**NAC 445B.875 Definitions.** ([NRS 233B.050](#))

1. As used in [NAC 445B.875](#) to [445B.899](#), inclusive, unless the context otherwise requires, the words and terms defined in [NAC 445B.877](#) to [445B.884](#), inclusive, have the meanings ascribed to them in those sections.

2. The meanings ascribed to words not included in [NAC 445B.877](#) to [445B.884](#), inclusive, are in accordance with applicable sections of NAC governing air quality, water pollution or solid waste management and of [chapters 444](#), [445A](#) and [445B](#) of NRS.

[Environmental Comm'n, Practice Rule 1 § B, eff. 1-7-73; A and renumbered as § 1.2, 1-9-76]—(NAC A 11-9-95; R227-03, 4-20-2004)

**NAC 445B.877 “Appellant” defined.** ([NRS 233B.050](#)) “Appellant” means any person:

1. Who requests a hearing before the Commission, pursuant to [chapter 278](#), [444](#), [444A](#), [445A](#), [445B](#), [459](#), [486A](#) or [519A](#) of NRS or the Commission’s regulations concerning the control of air or water pollution or the management of solid waste; or

2. Whose appearance before the Commission is required by:

(a) The Director;

(b) An authorized representative of the Director; or

(c) A person who is designated by or pursuant to a county or city ordinance or a regional agreement or regulation to enforce local ordinances or regulations for the control of air pollution.

**NAC 445B.879 “Commission” defined.** ([NRS 233B.050](#)) “Commission” means the State Environmental Commission or a panel of three or more members of the State Environmental Commission in accordance with [NRS 445A.610](#) and [445B.350](#), where appropriate.

**NAC 445B.881 “Department” defined.** ([NRS 233B.050](#)) “Department” means the State Department of Conservation and Natural Resources.

(Supplied in codification)—(Substituted in revision for NAC 445.983)

**NAC 445B.882 “Director” defined.** ([NRS 233B.050](#)) “Director” means the Director of the Department.

**NAC 445B.884 “Person” defined.** ([NRS 233B.050](#)) “Person” has the meaning ascribed to it in [NRS 445B.150](#).

**NAC 445B.886 Petitions to adopt, file, amend or repeal regulations.** ([NRS 233B.050](#))

1. Any interested person may petition the Commission in writing for the adoption, filing, amendment or repeal of any regulation and shall accompany his petition with relevant data, views and arguments as required by form 1.\*

2. Upon submission of a petition, the Commission will within 30 days either deny the petition in writing stating its reasons or initiate regulation-making proceedings in accordance with [NRS 444.560](#), [445A.435](#) or [445B.215](#), whichever is applicable.

\*(See adopting agency for form.)

**NAC 445B.888 Declaratory orders, advisory opinions. ([NRS 233B.050](#))**

1. Any member of the public may petition the Commission for a declaratory order or an advisory opinion as to the applicability of any statutory provision, Commission regulation or decision as required by form 2.\*

2. Upon submission of a petition, the Commission will within 30 days issue a declaratory order or an advisory opinion in writing stating reasons for its action.

\*(See adopting agency for form.)

**NAC 445B.890 Request for hearing. ([NRS 233B.050](#))** Any person requesting a hearing before the Commission concerning a final decision of the Department may do so by filing a request, within 10 days after notice of the action of the Department, on form 3\* with the State Environmental Commission, 901 S. Stewart Street, Suite 4001, Carson City, Nevada 89701-5249.

\*(See adopting agency for form.)

**NAC 445B.891 Notice of hearing. ([NRS 233B.050](#))**

1. The Secretary of the Commission will schedule a hearing to be held within 20 days after receipt of the request for a hearing or an order to appear before the Commission.

2. All of the parties must be notified by registered or certified mail of the date thereof which must be no less than 5 days after the date of notification. The notice must include:

(a) A statement of the time, place and nature of hearing;

(b) A statement of the legal authority and jurisdiction under which the hearing is to be held;

(c) A reference to the particular sections of NRS and NAC allegedly violated; and

(d) A brief and concise statement of the matters asserted or the issues involved.

[Environmental Comm'n, Practice Rule 4, eff. 1-7-73; A 4-3-74; A and renumbered as Rule 9, 1-9-76]—(Substituted in revision for NAC 445.989)

**NAC 445B.8915 Intervention in certain proceedings. ([NRS 233B.050](#), [445B.210](#))**

1. A person, other than a party to a proceeding, who believes that he may be directly and substantially affected by the proceeding may request an order to intervene in the proceeding by filing a written petition for leave to intervene with the Commission.

2. Except as otherwise provided in this subsection, a petition for leave to intervene must be filed with the Commission not later than 10 calendar days after the notice of appeal related to the proceeding in which the intervention is sought is filed with the Commission pursuant to the provisions of [NRS 445B.340](#). The petitioner shall serve a

notice of a petition for leave to intervene upon each party to the proceeding. A party may file a response to the petition within 5 calendar days after receipt of the petition. If a petitioner files a petition for leave to intervene with the Commission after the period prescribed in this subsection, the petition must set forth the reason for the delay in filing the petition. The petition for leave to intervene must:

- (a) Identify the proceeding in which the petitioner requests leave to intervene;
- (b) Set forth the name and address of the petitioner and, if the petitioner is represented by an attorney or other authorized person, the name, address and telephone number of the attorney or other authorized person;
- (c) Contain a clear and concise statement of the direct and substantial interest of the petitioner in the proceeding;
- (d) Set forth the manner in which the petitioner will be affected by the proceeding; and
- (e) Include a statement indicating whether or not the petitioner intends to present evidence in the proceeding.

3. If a petition for leave to intervene demonstrates a direct and substantial interest in the subject matter of the proceeding or any part of the proceeding and does not unreasonably broaden the issues or prejudice any party to the proceeding, the Commission may grant leave to intervene or otherwise appear and participate in the proceeding with respect to the matters set forth in the petition.

4. If it appears during a proceeding that an intervener has no direct or substantial interest in the proceeding or that the public interest does not require his participation in the proceeding, the Commission may dismiss the intervener from the proceeding.

(Added to NAC by Environmental Comm'n by R227-03, eff. 4-20-2004)

#### **NAC 445B.892 Subpoenas. ([NRS 233B.050](#))**

1. Subpoenas to compel attendance of any person at a hearing or to require the production of books, records or other documents may be issued by the Commission.

2. Requests for the issuance of subpoenas must be made to the Commission in writing no less than 5 days prior to the hearing date, setting forth the reason and necessity for the subpoenas. Upon good cause shown, subpoenas may be issued at the request of any party to the hearing at any time. The Commission may issue any subpoenas on its own initiative without request.

3. All costs incident to subpoenas issued at the request of appellant must be borne by the appellant. The Commission may demand payment of those costs prior to the issuance of the subpoenas.

[Environmental Comm'n, Practice Rule 5, eff. 1-7-73; A 4-3-74; A and renumbered as Rule 10, 1-9-76]—(Substituted in revision for NAC 445.990)

#### **NAC 445B.8925 Briefs. ([NRS 233B.050](#))**

1. The Commission may, upon its motion or a motion by a party, order briefs to be filed before or after a hearing and shall prescribe the period during which the briefs must be filed.

2. Each brief must be accompanied by an acknowledgment of service or a certificate of mailing for all parties.

**NAC 445B.893 Panels to conduct certain hearings; decision of panel.** ([NRS 233B.050](#)) Three or more members of the Commission constitute a proper panel, where appropriate, in accordance with [NRS 445A.610](#) and [445B.350](#), and a majority of those present must concur in any decision. The decision will be in writing and is a public record.

**NAC 445B.894 Change in time or place of hearing; informal disposition of matter.** ([NRS 233B.050](#))

1. Upon good cause shown, the Commission may vacate and reset the time of hearing.

2. Upon good cause shown, the Commission may transfer the place of hearing to a more appropriate location, taking into consideration the convenience and fairness to the witnesses and the parties.

3. Unless otherwise provided by law, informal disposition may be made by all involved parties at any time of any contested case or matter.

**NAC 445B.895 Appearance of parties; procedure at hearing.** ([NRS 233B.050](#))

1. The parties may appear in person and may be represented by counsel. All testimony must be given under oath and recorded verbatim pursuant to the provisions of [NAC 445B.897](#).

2. The Commission:

(a) Will determine the order of the presentation of evidence; and

(b) May limit the time and scope of the examination of witnesses and disallow repetitive testimony.

3. Hearings are open to the public until such time as confidential information, within the meaning of [chapter 445B](#) of NRS or applicable sections of this chapter or [chapter 445A](#) of NAC, is admitted to the record, at which time the hearing will be closed.

**NAC 445B.8953 Conduct at hearing; maintenance of order.** ([NRS 233B.050](#))

1. A person who appears in a proceeding shall conform to the recognized standards of ethical and courteous conduct as determined by the Commission. All parties to a hearing, their counsel and the spectators shall conduct themselves in a respectful manner.

2. The Commission may take any action which it determines is necessary to maintain order during a hearing, including, without limitation:

(a) Excluding a party or his attorney or authorized representative from the hearing;

(b) Excluding a witness from the hearing; and

(c) Limiting the taking of testimony and presentation of evidence during the hearing.

(Added to NAC by Environmental Comm'n by R227-03, eff. 4-20-2004)

**NAC 445B.8957 Consolidation of proceedings.** ([NRS 233B.050](#))

1. The Commission may consolidate two or more proceedings if it appears that the issues are substantially the same and the rights of the parties will not be prejudiced by the consolidation.

2. At a consolidated hearing, the Commission will determine the order in which the parties introduce evidence and present testimony.

3. If two or more parties have substantially similar interests and positions, the Commission may, at any time during the hearing, limit the number of witnesses who will be allowed to testify.

**NAC 445B.896 Findings of Commission. ([NRS 233B.050](#))**

1. At the conclusion of the hearing, the Commission may take the case under submission and will notify the appellant and any other party to the hearing of its findings and recommendations in writing within 30 days after the date of the hearing.

2. Final recommendations will be in writing and will separately state findings of fact and conclusions of law. Findings of fact and recommendations will be based upon substantial evidence. Findings of fact will include a concise statement of the evidentiary facts supporting the findings.

**NAC 445B.897 Record of hearing. ([NRS 233B.050](#))**

1. Each hearing must be recorded electronically. An electronic recording of the hearing must be made available for inspection or copying. A party who requests a copy of an electronic recording must pay the cost to copy the recording.

2. In addition to the provisions of subsection 1, a party may request that a hearing be recorded by a court reporter who is certified pursuant to [chapter 656](#) of NRS. A party who requests that a hearing be recorded by a court reporter must pay the costs relating to the services of the court reporter, including the cost charged by the court reporter for providing a transcript of the hearing.

**NAC 445B.899 Petitions for reconsideration or rehearing. ([NRS 233B.050](#))**

1. A petition for reconsideration must specifically:

(a) Identify each portion of the challenged decision which the petitioner deems to be unlawful, unreasonable, or based on erroneous conclusions of law or mistaken facts; and

(b) Cite those portions of the record, the law or the rules of the Commission which support the allegations in the petition. The petition may not contain additional evidentiary matter or require the submission or taking of evidence.

2. A petition for rehearing must:

(a) Allege that a decision is in error because of an incomplete or inaccurate record;

(b) Specifically set forth the nature and purpose of any additional evidence to be introduced; and

(c) Show that such evidence is not merely cumulative and could not have been introduced at the hearing.

3. A petition for reconsideration or rehearing of a decision must be served upon all parties of record within 15 days after the effective date of the decision.

4. An answer to a petition for reconsideration or rehearing may be filed with the Commission by any party of record in the proceeding within 5 days after the filing of the petition. The answer must be confined to the issues contained in the petition and served upon all parties of record. Proof of service must be attached to the answer.

5. The Commission will grant or deny a petition for reconsideration or rehearing within 10 days after the date of the filing of the petition. The denial of a petition may be on the record without a separate decision.

6. Unless otherwise ordered by the Commission, the filing of a petition for reconsideration or rehearing or the granting of such a petition does not excuse compliance with, or suspend the effectiveness of, the challenged decision.

7. If the Commission grants a petition for reconsideration, it will reexamine the record and decision with regard to the issues on which reconsideration was granted and issue a modified final decision or affirm its original decision within 20 days after the petition is granted.

8. If the Commission grants a petition for rehearing, it will, within 20 days thereafter, conduct a hearing to allow the parties to present additional evidence and will issue a modified final decision or affirm its original decision.

9. A modified final decision of the Commission issued upon reconsideration or rehearing will incorporate those portions of the original decision which are not changed by the modified final decision.

10. A modified final decision of the Commission or the affirmation of an original decision of the Commission is a final decision for the purposes of judicial review.